

My previous comment wrt McKenzie's report was: start quote if this were a fisheries stock assessment, the working group would demand to see the equations used to make predictions, and the likelihood functions, and the prior functions; would want to see the fits and the diagnostics from the fit, and the diagnostics from the traces. end quote

In response to this Darryl has shown two traces. They look OK but they're not "diagnostics from the traces", and there has been no attempt to show the likelihoods or the model fits to the data or their diagnostics. This is not acceptable.

Louise should comment on the resighting probabilities for branded females: they are suspiciously low.

Figure 25 shows a probability of breeding for four-year-olds who bred in the previous year. but there are no 3-year-old breeders, so how can that be? Figure 24 shows a positive probability of breeding for 3-year-olds: how can that be?

There is no attempt to explore whether these population parameters would allow the population to replace itself; I suspect they would not. Does the TWG think that sea lions are becoming extinct even without fishing?

Paul A. Breen, Principal Scientist
NIWA Box 14901
Wellington 6241 New Zealand
04 386 0518 / 021 252 5066
