

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 12 July 2021 9:34 pm
To: [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Cc: Media; Ian Angus
Subject: RE: Fwd: RE: Vet visit to the orca

Thanks [REDACTED]

Sent with BlackBerry Work
(www.blackberry.com)

From: [REDACTED]
Date: Monday, 12 Jul 2021, 9:28 PM
To: [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>
Cc: Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>, Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: Fwd: RE: Vet visit to the orca

Fyi below is latest sitrep on orca. Not for publication, just for your background information.

Ian Angus is scheduled to do interview on Morning Report at 7.55am.

Main focus is on finding and reconnecting orca with its pod. Animal welfare is front of mind.

Cheers
[REDACTED]

Sent from Workspace ONE Boxer

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>
Date: 12/07/2021 9:19 pm
Subject: RE: Vet visit to the orca

To: [REDACTED], Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Social Media <socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>
Cc: [REDACTED] <@wellingtonzoo.com>

Thanks folks. Started responding to some of the media interviews. Questions have focused on plan and when might we stop with the effort. Im sticking to plan is rehabilitate calf as best we can and relocate into pod if can locate. Stayed on that message.

Sent from Workspace ONE Boxer

On 12/07/2021 9:00 pm, [REDACTED] > wrote:

Thanks [REDACTED] Just adding some names to the content below. I have copied [REDACTED] from the Zoo who is responsible for communications.

[REDACTED] is the Wellington Zoo Senior Vet based at The Nest Te Kōhanga hospital along with [REDACTED] and [REDACTED], also from the Zoo, assisting.

[REDACTED] will provide an update to us if they have any results back tomorrow.

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday, 12 July 2021 8:32 pm

To: [REDACTED]; Media
[REDACTED] Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]
Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>; Social Media
<socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]

Subject: RE: Vet visit to the orca

Evening update provided by [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]:

The vet took bloods and zoo will process and also send to lab.

Noted deep abrasions on the tail and they have administered lasting antibiotics partly due to this and partly as general precaution.

They have taken nasal/blowhole swab.

Orally administered fluids.

Treatment suggested by [REDACTED] and agreed by Ingrid.

Zoo will return 7:30 am tomorrow to show experienced whale rescue staff and vets how to administer oral fluids.

Fluids to be repeated 4x daily.

[REDACTED] lead zoo vet.

Calf tends one side, often lying on its side. May be due to stiff pectoral fin from being on a trailer or other causes.

Will need to recover from this for release to be viable. It can swim freely, though not well, and vocalists.

Vet recommend minimal disturbance from people and dogs, as well as PPE for people working close with calf to prevent zoonotic diseases. Gloves and face masks needed.

Calf will be in water overnight with people taking turns watching over it. Wetsuit 5mm or drysuit required. 1 hour shifts.

I will provide social with an image shared by [REDACTED].

Ngā mihi nui,

[REDACTED]
Marketing Communications Advisor | Kaitohutohu Whakapātairanga

Department of Conservation | *Te Papa Atawhai*

M: +[REDACTED]

Tāmaki Makaurau/Auckland Office

Bledisloe House, 24 Wellesley Street, Auckland 1010

Conservation leadership for our nature/*Tākina te hī, Tiakina, te hā o te Āo Tūroa*

After Hours Media Support: Phone: +64 4 496 1911 / media@doc.govt.nz



From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Monday, 12 July 2021 5:43 pm

To: [REDACTED]

Cc: [REDACTED] Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]>;

Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]>

Subject: Vet visit to the orca

Re Media update for the evening newsroom:

The vets have arrived on site at 530pm..

Once [REDACTED], Vet, has provided fluids and assessed the calf she will make contact with me. They will not be staying.

[REDACTED] has spoken with [REDACTED] and received information from her and other marine experts regarding the best approach.

The advice they have received is to provide fluids to the animal every 3 hours!

If this happens then we will need to close off public access, which Ingrid agrees as not an easy activity to explain to the uninitiated.

████ will take photos and send through to myself and █████. He only has his phone with him now but will take his fancy cameras tomorrow.

The calf is in the water un-constrained other than a wall of people to stop it wandering off.

A fence is being set up along the area to enable the calf to remain in the water without human intervention.

Jack spoke with the █████ from the Zoo to confirm the responsibilities.

DOC is managing this under the Marine Mammal Act

Ingrid and her crew are operational in providing their knowledge and knowhow.

I have no further update at this stage other than Whale Rescue have gone out asking for support and currently people are turning up in wetsuits to go onto a roster for the evening.

Eventually no people will be in the water with the calf but in a small dingy.

████, DOC Bio diversity Ranger will be on site at 730 tomorrow then █████ will take over around 10am.

Action

I will update later tonight once I hear from █████

I will make contact with █████ once he is on site in the morning and had a chance to his eye in so to speak.

Next steps will be decision on whether we send out another aircraft (chopper or plane) to search for pod?

████████████████████
Supervisor Community – Kaitiaki Tauawhi, Ao Hapori
Kapiti Wellington District Office

████████████████████
████████████████████ Conservation
Te Papa Atawhai

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 12 July 2021 4:02 pm
To: [REDACTED] Social Media; Ian Angus
Cc: [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Subject: Stranded orca response

Importance: High

Hi all,

Just confirming that we're all on the same page following various meetings and conversations.

There is now a CIMS structure of the stranded orca calf. All comms must be signed off by the Incident Controller

[REDACTED]. Ian Angus is the official spokesperson.

[REDACTED] is putting together an update after 4.30 which will need to be put on our social media channels asap upon signoff.

We will send through the confirmed statement and media lines once approved.

[REDACTED] will use that update to respond to after-hours media queries.

[REDACTED] will put together another update for later this evening for the plan over night and when the next update will be.

This needs to go on social channels asap upon sign off.

Ian Angus will be available for media interviews in the morning.

NOT FOR PUBLICATION:

- Orca is showing signs of deteriorating condition, vets are going to try rehydrate it with electrolytes around 4-4.30pm
- Orca is in water near boat jetty – confined to an area by fencing.
- People are in the water with it, we're trying to determine if it can swim on its own.
- Goal at this stage is to find the pod and return the calf to it
- DOC has a boat out looking for the pod
- The welfare of the animal is the utmost importance.
- There are around 100 people on site, mostly bystanders with their kids.
- DOC needs people to stay back so teams can focus on the orca and to ensure people are safe.
- DOC is leading the operation, with support from Whale Rescue and volunteers.

Ngā mihi,

[REDACTED]
Team Lead National Communications | Kaimanatū Tuku Whakapā

Media and Communications Team, Wellington

Department of Conservation | Te Papa Atawhai

18 - 32 Manners Street - Te Aro - Wellington - 6011

PH: [REDACTED]

<http://www.doc.govt.nz/>

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[Redacted]

From: [Redacted]
Sent: Tuesday, 13 July 2021 11:24 am
To: [Redacted]
Cc: Media; Bronwyn Saunders; [Redacted]; Ian Angus
Subject: Juvenile orca - this morning's update

Kia ora,

The update below is our latest public messaging on the juvenile orca at Plimmerton. This has been shared with media outlets and posted to our social media channels.

****UPDATE****

8.30AM, 13 July 2021

Last night the orca calf stranded near Plimmerton received fluids from specialist veterinary staff and its condition improved.

It was less active this morning and the veterinarian has given the calf another dose of fluids. We've also arranged for some tests to be done on the calf but have no results as yet.

The DOC boat Mataara has resumed the search for the calf's pod and we are urging anyone in the area who has seen the orca pod to contact us on 0800 DOC HOT.

We are again appealing to the public to stay clear of the site while we continue efforts to save this calf.

Thanks for the messages of support to our team and volunteers working at the scene.

We expect to issue a new update for public/media this afternoon.

[Redacted]

[Redacted]
Communication Advisor – Hauraki, Waikato, Taranaki
Department of Conservation
Regional Office
Rostrevor St
Hamilton
[Redacted]



[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Tuesday, 13 July 2021 1:40 pm
To: [REDACTED]
Cc: Media; Ian Angus
Subject: Orca update - 1.40pm
Attachments: image001.png

Kia ora,
Latest update on the orca, for media, is below.

This is being shared to our channels and will also be passed on to journalists requesting updates.



Media release

13 July 2021

New update on stranded juvenile orca in Porirua

Efforts to save the orca calf stranded at Plimmerton are continuing today (13 July), with Department of Conservation (DOC) working alongside Whale Rescue and volunteers.

Rehabilitating the animal and reuniting it with its pod remains our objective.

DOC has vessel out at sea searching for the pod.

A local pilot has also volunteered to support the search and has made one flight today. He will make a second flight this afternoon.

There has been a reported sighting of a pod of orca in the Marlborough Sounds. DOC is encouraging the public to report any orca pod sightings to us – the range is from the Marlborough Sounds to Whanganui.

“If anyone sees the orca pod, we’re particularly interested in location details, the direction of travel of the pod, and any markings on the back/saddle of the members of the pod and their dorsal fins,” says DOC’s Marine Species Manager Ian Angus.

The animal has been fed nutritional supplements through a tube by veterinarians. This method of feeding does cause the animal some distress but is the only option to keep the animal alive at this time.

“We’re working with veterinarians to gain valuable expert advice from scientists overseas.”

Mr Angus says DOC appreciates the continued support of the public but is asking people to stay clear of the site to allow us and Whale Rescue to do our work.

-Ends-

[REDACTED]
Communication Advisor – Hauraki, Waikato, Taranaki
Department of Conservation
Regional Office
Rostrevor St
Hamilton



Unite
against
COVID-19



Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

From: [REDACTED]

Sent: Friday, 16 July 2021 3:29 PM

To: K Allan (MIN) <k.allan@ministers.govt.nz>

Cc: Rt Hon Jacinda Ardern <Jacinda.Ardern@parliament.govt.nz>

Subject: Save Baby Toa

Kia ora Kiritapu me Jacinda hoki.

I was alarmed to hear on TV One midday news today that all options are on the table regarding baby Toa, and that rescue operations have gone above and beyond that usually carried out by the Department of Conservation. I read this as code for DOC are preparing to euthanise the calf.

Baby Toa is currently doing well and has captured the heart of the nation.

Euthanising the calf will be a public relations nightmare for DOC and the Labour Government.

I would encourage you and your department to listen and follow the advice of the cetacean specialists and local Iwi and not to act unilaterally as they appear to be preparing to do.

Nga mihi

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Saturday, 17 July 2021 6:59 pm
To: Bronwyn Saunders; [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Subject: RE: Fwd: Orca Update: Orca pod sighted off Kapiti

Thanks

[REDACTED]
Press secretary to Hon Kiri Allan

From: Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz>
Date: Saturday, 17 Jul 2021, 6:44 PM
To: [REDACTED] <[\[REDACTED\]@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)>, [REDACTED] <[\[REDACTED\]@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)>, [REDACTED] <[\[REDACTED\]@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)>
Subject: Fwd: Orca Update: Orca pod sighted off Kapiti

Fyi

Cheers
Bronwyn

----- Forwarded message -----

From: [REDACTED]
Date: 17/07/2021 6:38 pm
Subject: Orca Update: Orca pod sighted off Kapiti
To: [REDACTED]
Cc:



Media release

17/07/2021

Orca pod sighted of Wellington Coast

A credible sighting of a pod of orca has been reported off the Kapiti Coast, near where the juvenile orca stranded last Sunday, but weather conditions in the area make it unsafe for further investigation. DOC marine species manager Ian Angus says once the weather conditions improve, a team will be able to investigate further.

“At the moment any reunion attempt would be too dangerous for both the people involved and the orca calf. “Once conditions improve we will be in a better position to investigate the sighting further, and make a plan from there.”

People should not travel out searching for the pod during the storm, Ian says.

The orca is in a stable condition and remains in the temporary pool it was transferred to on Thursday evening due to health and safety concerns with the incoming storm.

The calf has now been away from his pod for a week after becoming stranded on rocks near Plimmerton, north of Wellington. An ongoing operation to care for the orca calf is being led by DOC with support from Orca Research Trust/Whale Rescue Trust, local iwi Ngāti Toa Rangatira, and the local community.

Anyone who sights orca pods off the lower North Island’s west coast – particularly between Wellington and Taranaki – is urged to provide as much information as possible to DOC, via marinemammals@doc.govt.nz or by calling 0800 DOC HOT (0800 362 468).

Essential information includes location of the pod, direction of travel of the animals, and photographs or videos which clearly show the saddle/back markings of the animals and their dorsal fins.

Editors note: Media requests over the weekend are by appointment only and should be emailed to media@doc.govt.nz along with any specific questions, the reporter's name and direct phone line. Images of the calf can be lifted from the DOC website or social media channels. For general information on orca, please visit www.doc.govt.nz where all updates on this situation are published.

–Ends–

For older updates please see <https://www.doc.govt.nz/news/media-releases/2021-media-releases/4.30pm-update-on-stranded-juvenile-orca-in-porirua/>

Contacts:

media@doc.govt.nz

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[REDACTED]

From: Government Services
Sent: Monday, 19 July 2021 12:11 pm
To: [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Cc: Government Services
Subject: FW: Run sheet Plimmerton orca visit 19 July 2021 **URGENT**
Attachments: Run sheet Plimmerton orca visit 19 July 2021.docx

Importance: High

Kia ora – The email from Sarah Owen belowsid the first I knew about this event.
Is the attached going to be sufficient for you?

Ngā mihi

[REDACTED]

From: Sarah Owen <sarahowen@doc.govt.nz>
Sent: Monday, 19 July 2021 11:40 am
To: Government Services <GovernmentServices@doc.govt.nz>
Cc: Jack Mace <jmace@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: Run sheet Plimmerton orca visit 19 July 2021
Apologies team – have problems out here with Amazon – here is the best I can do re visit this afternoon for Minister – let me know what else you may require

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

Run Sheet

Event: Visit to Plimmerton Boating Club to meet team re juvenile orca calf

Date: 19 July 2021

Date and location, Monday 19 July Plimmerton Boating Club, 66 Moana Drive, Plimmerton			
Time	Programme	Attendees	Notes
2pm?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Meet with CIMs Incident Controller - Meet Ngati Toa members on site - Meet Whale Watch/Orca Research team and volunteers 	Director Lower North Island – Jack Mace CIMs Incident Controller Dave Smith Iwi – ██████████ Ingrid Visser and ██████████ ██████████ and Huha vets	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Visit with orca at pool – led by Ingrid and team 		The orca is being fed every 2 hours
	Discussion with team onsite	DOC / Iwi / Ingrid	Informal discussion and any questions answered



[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 19 July 2021 1:07 pm
To: Jack Mace
Cc: [REDACTED] (@Parliament); Sarah Owen; Dave Smith; Government Services
Subject: RE: Run sheet Plimmerton orca visit 19 July 2021

Thanks Jack. See you soon.

Ngā mihi

[REDACTED]



[REDACTED] | Private Secretary (Conservation)
Office of Hon. Kiritapu Allan
4.5L Executive Wing, Parliament Buildings | Private Bag 18888 | Wellington 6160 |
New Zealand
T: + [REDACTED] [@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)

From: Jack Mace [mailto:jmace@doc.govt.nz]
Sent: Monday, 19 July 2021 1:06 PM
To: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
Cc: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED] <Sarah.Campin-[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]@doc.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@doc.govt.nz; [REDACTED] <GovernmentServices@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: Fwd: Run sheet Plimmerton orca visit 19 July 2021

Kia ora Huia

Quick run sheet. Please forgive informality as quite an evolving situation today.

Cheers
Jack

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[REDACTED]

From: Jack Mace
Sent: Tuesday, 20 July 2021 4:48 pm
To: [REDACTED]; Bronwyn Saunders; [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Cc: Ian Angus; Sarah Owen; [REDACTED]; Kirstie Knowles; Elizabeth Heeg; [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Questions re Toa

Thanks team

Sent from Workspace ONE Boxer

On 20/07/2021 3:10 pm, [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz wrote:
Thanks Bronwyn
Minister was interviewed by [REDACTED] this arvo
Said v similar things to this, after talking Ian

From: Bronwyn Saunders [mailto:bsaunders@doc.govt.nz]
Sent: Tuesday, 20 July 2021 3:01 PM
To: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
Cc: Jack Mace <jmace@doc.govt.nz>; Elizabeth Heeg <eheeg@doc.govt.nz>; Sarah Owen <sarahowen@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED] Kirstie Knowles <kknowles@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED] Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: Questions re Toa
FYI

From: Bronwyn Saunders
Sent: Tuesday, 20 July 2021 3:00 pm
To: [REDACTED]@stuff.co.nz; Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Questions re Toa

H [REDACTED]

Here's a response to your questions.

Please attribute the answers to Department of Conservation's Lower North Island Operations Director Jack Mace.

-DOC's usual practise is not to intervene in the lives and welfare of wild animals - why was this case different?
DOC regularly provides welfare and rescue support for injured or distressed wildlife. This case is no different in that we responded to the stranding of a very young orca calf. The Orca Research Trust was also involved. This is unique in that it is a baby orca that is still being weaned and it has now been supported for more than 9 days in an enclosed area which will be New Zealand's longest marine mammal stranding response for an individual animal.

-If another whale of this age was stranded in similar circumstances next month, would anything be done differently? Does Toa set a new precedent for intervention, or has he shown us that it can often get us in too deep?
It is impossible to say whether things would be done differently. We are learning from this current operation and there are no easy solutions. Our goal is to maintain the orca's health while we look to locate its pod and try to return the calf to its mother. Every stranding is different but the one thing that does remain the same, is that any decisions are made in the best interests of the stranded animal/s.

-What are the odds, now, that a reuniting of Toa and his pod will be successful if they are located?
It is a really long shot and, while hopeful, we are being realistic about the chances of success.

-Has euthanasia been discussed, and how much would Toa's welfare have to decline to to make this the best option?
We are planning for a range of scenarios. Nothing has been ruled out at this stage including euthanasia if it is determined by the experts to be the most humane option in the best interests of the calf.

-Roughly how many hours of DOC staff's time has been dedicated to work surrounding the orca calf?

We've had staff working around the clock since the Orca calf stranded on Sunday 4 July. At any one time we probably have about 20 staff across a range of disciplines working on this operation, but it is impossible to say as we deploy resources each day depending on what is needed. It is also important to note that there have been many iwi and rescue trust volunteers as well as FENZ volunteer brigade and other Plimmerton community members who have also made a huge contribution to the operation.

From: [redacted]@stuff.co.nz

Sent: Tuesday, 20 July 2021 1:17 pm

To: Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>

Subject: Questions re Toa

Hi media team, hope you're all well. I have some questions I'd love to have answered please!

- DOC's usual practise is not to intervene in the lives and welfare of wild animals - why was this case different?
 - If another whale of this age was stranded in similar circumstances next month, would anything be done differently?
 - Does Toa set a new precedent for intervention, or has he shown us that it can often get us in too deep?
 - What are the odds, now, that a reuniting of Toa and his pod will be successful if they are located?
 - Has euthanasia been discussed, and how much would Toa's welfare have to decline to to make this the best option?
 - Roughly how many hours of DOC staff's time has been dedicated to work surrounding the orca calf?
- My deadline is 3pm please. If some questions are unable to be answered in time, please do send me back as much as you can by the deadline.
- Thanks heaps!

[redacted]
Reporter (she/her)
E [redacted]@stuff.co.nz | [redacted]



Stuff, Level 7, Spark Central, 42-52 Willis Street
PO Box 2595, Wellington 6140

The information contained in this e-mail message and any accompanying files is or may be confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, any use, dissemination, reliance, forwarding, printing or copying of this e-mail or any attached files is unauthorised. This e-mail is subject to copyright. No part of it should be reproduced, adapted or communicated without the written consent of the copyright owner. If you have received this e-mail in error please advise the sender immediately by return e-mail or telephone and delete all copies. Stuff does not guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information contained in this e-mail or attached files. Internet communications are not secure, therefore Stuff does not accept legal responsibility for the contents of this message or attached files.

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 4:53 PM
To: k.allan@ministers.govt.nz <k.allan@ministers.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]; Rt. Hon Jacinda Ardern <Jacinda.Ardern@parliament.govt.nz>
Cc: Judith Collins <judith.collins@national.org.nz>; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
Subject: Re: Academic incompetence.

FYI.

Academic minds verses practical solutions.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 1:33 PM
To: k.allan@ministers.govt.nz <k.allan@ministers.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]; Rt. Hon Jacinda Ardern <Jacinda.Ardern@parliament.govt.nz>
Cc: Judith Collins <judith.collins@national.org.nz>
Subject: Re: Academic incompetence.

[REDACTED]

I am perplexed at the levels of gross incompetence I see in managing the Orca calf fiasco.

Please organise a semi submersed cage, put the Calf in it.

Tow it out with a boat.

And tend to its direct need, and nothing else, until its mother comes by.

Absolutely disgusting is the display of Academics stupidity, with everyone over thinking the basics.

Pass to [REDACTED].

Academic foolishness on a grand scale.

Kind regards.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 12:35 PM
To: k.allan@ministers.govt.nz <k.allan@ministers.govt.nz>
Cc: Judith Collins <judith.collins@national.org.nz>
Subject: Academic incompetence.
Animal husbandry.

Baby Orca.

Dear minister.

I realise that Doc representatives are in discussion with many academic experts across and around the globe,

Human safety laws and issues can not merge with a wild animal.

Positions of management, require many different information bases and sources.

The very basic issues here is that the Orca calf is separated, it can't communicate with, nor can it hear, it's Mother or its pod.

Solutions are, within recognition of the under water sound propagation properties.

Either put the Calf in a sea pen on a good area between there and Levin.

Let it communicate.

Setting up an under water speaker is not hard.

Or make a harness, tow it out behind a boat, jet skie, and wait it out.

Humans over thinking basic problems is becoming an industry.

The only casualty in this "academic fiasco" is an Orca calf.

If you have any leadership, or empathy towards nature, I ask you respectfully to instruct these "Stupid"academics in the use of practical solutions.

Any farmer, or animal behaviourist would have solved the issue by now, if they being left out of politics, and media story telling.

Regards

[REDACTED]

From: Kirstie Knowles
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 1:25 pm
To: [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Cc: Elizabeth Heeg
Subject: Kapiti Orca Calf - Scenarios Paper - DOC-6729062
Attachments: Kapiti Orca Calf - Scenarios Paper - DOC-6729062.docx

Kia ora [REDACTED]

Please find attached the orca stranding response scenarios paper for your information.

Please note that DOC officials are planning to talk through this paper this afternoon with Ngāti Toa Rangatira and the Orca Research Trust/WhaleRescue.org (both led by Dr Ingrid Visser). We will be putting a decision paper to the decision maker tomorrow, drawing on the views shared today.

Ngā mihi nui,

Kirstie

Kirstie Knowles (she/her)

Manager Marine Ecosystems – *Kaimātanga Mātai Ahu Moana*

Aquatic Unit, Biodiversity Group – *Kāhui Kanorau Koiora*

Department of Conservation – *Te Papa Atawhai*

Phone: [REDACTED]

www.doc.govt.nz



~Toitū te marae o Tane, Toitū te marae o Tangaroa, Toitū te iwi - If the land endures, and the sea endures, so too will the people~



Please consider the environment before you print this e-mail

CONFIDENTIAL

Orca Technical Paper

Best Available Information
22 July 2021

CONFIDENTIAL

APPENDIX I – Scenarios

* Success = orca calf successfully reintegrated into a pod of wild orca and no longer dependent on human care and not seeking out human interactions.

General points (legally privileged)

• [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
1	Release calf (no pod)	Could happen at any time	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Significant welfare concerns about releasing an unweaned calf without a lactating female present, as it will almost certainly die slowly from starvation. TAG considered this was not an option for cultural/ethical/animal welfare reasons. 	[REDACTED]	<p>HIGH</p> <p>The calf is going to rapidly become physically unwell due to lack of food. This will make it weak, immunocompromised, hypoglycaemic and a range of other physical health concerns.</p>	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Extreme stress of isolation and lack of food</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Calf not yet weaned and will almost certainly die slowly from starvation.</p>	<p>HIGH</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>This will be seen as not only abandoning rescue efforts, but failing to appropriately consider welfare issues.</p>	See sub-options	<p>LOW</p> <p>Easiest scenario operationally</p>	<p>NIL - NOT RECOMMENDED</p> <p>Option should not be considered except as part of scenario 1A or 1B below</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
				[REDACTED]								
1A	Reunite with natal pod	Whenever natal pod is located	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Might take a significant length of time to locate the natal pod • May be difficult to transport to the pod, if identified • Requires post-release monitoring to confirm whether reunification has been successful. Failure may occur for a range of reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Reuniting might fail if mother is not able to feed the calf upon return. Female likely to stop lactating after 30 days, however could be shorter. Some spontaneous lactation has been recorded in 2 different Beluga whales. 	[REDACTED]	<p>MODERATE Injury risk sustained during transport.</p> <p>Requires satellite tag to be applied, which is physically invasive.</p> <p>Starvation risk if mother has stopped lactating or the mother/ pod rejects the calf.</p> <p>Direct injuries from the pod if the calf is not accepted (ramming, raking etc)</p>	<p>MODERATE Stress of handling/ transportation.</p> <p>While calf may benefit from being with natal pod, rejection would cause significant stress.</p> <p>If the calf has habituated to humans putting it back into a pod environment is also likely to be stressful.</p>	<p>HIGH Stress during transportation and possible rejection/lack of food availability.</p> <p>No historical evidence of a case where such an activity demonstrated an outcome that was in the best interest of the calf. Survival for a longer duration of time is not in and of itself an acceptable animal welfare outcome. The quality of life</p>		<p>LOW Most people are hoping for this to be the scenario which unfolds</p>	<p><i>Scenario 2 – Extended holding time</i></p> <p><i>Scenario 3 – Transport</i></p> <p><i>Scenario 4 – Tagging and monitoring</i></p> <p><i>Scenario 6 – Recapture (if calf rejected)</i></p>	<p>HIGH Locating, confirming, and tracking the natal pod.</p> <p>Applying tag and ensuring health is appropriate for release.</p> <p>Appropriate boat to transfer calf to water.</p> <p>Safe and effective means of transferring calf to water.</p>	<p>LOW Relies upon a long chain of successes, but is considered the best chance for survival of the calf.</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			<p>Chance of this happening in such a young wild orca is unknown.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○Photos of natal pod include two adult females and not sure which is the mother. ○Pod may not accept calf for social reasons ○Calf may be in poor health for reasons not already diagnosed due to diagnostic restraints in cetaceans and the small area in which the animal is currently kept. Reuniting will not fix this. 	[REDACTED]			<p>during that time, and prevention of significant DIS-stress rather than stress or eustress is required.</p> <p>Lack of ability to monitor the stress level of the animal upon release, only life/death/location and limited ability to determine if feeding versus slow emaciation.</p>				<p>Staff H&S during operation.</p> <p>Needs contingencies in place for if the calf is rejected and required recapturing</p>	
1B	Release into a different pod with lactating female	Whenever a pod with a female and calf present is found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As above, with potentially lower likelihood that pod will accept calf. • TAG agreed this was less desirable option. 	[REDACTED]	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Injury risk sustained during transport.</p> <p>Requires satellite tag to be applied, which is physically invasive.</p> <p>Starvation risk if presumed lactating female rejects the calf or isn't lactating.</p> <p>Risk to other calf if lactating female attempts to provide for two calves simultaneously.</p> <p>Direct injuries from the pod if the calf is not accepted (ramming, raking etc)</p>	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Stress of handling/ transportation.</p> <p>While calf may benefit from being with a pod, there is a higher chance of rejection than the natal pod, which would cause significant stress.</p> <p>Extreme stress of isolation and lack of food</p> <p>If the calf has habituated to humans putting it back into a pod environment is also likely to be stressful</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Welfare risks are significant. All of the above apply, AND In comparable examples with other species where this sort of reintroduction attempt has been made, it has been made with the provisions that human intervention can quickly recover the individual animal and create a new plan for its welfare before any failure to integrate can result in serious injury, trauma, starvation, or disease.</p> <p>Stress during transportation and</p>		<p>LOW</p> <p>Most people are thinking this may be the scenario which unfolds</p>	<p>Scenario 2 – Extended holding time</p> <p>Scenario 3 – Transport</p> <p>Scenario 4 – Tagging and monitoring</p> <p>Scenario 6 – Recapture (if calf rejected)</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Locating, confirming, and tracking a pod with a potential lactating female.</p> <p>Applying tag and ensuring health is appropriate for release.</p> <p>Appropriate boat to transfer calf to water.</p> <p>Safe and effective means of transferring calf to water.</p> <p>Staff H&S during operation.</p> <p>Needs contingencies in place for if the</p>	<p>VERY LOW - NOT RECOMMENDED</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
							<p>likelihood of rejection/lack of food availability.</p> <p>Taking such risk with a wild animal, even assuming that wild animals face significant stress in their lifetimes, decisions in the calf's best interest while under DOC control should be made when the preponderance of evidence of a positive outcome outweighs the negative. There is no such evidence for a positive welfare outcome.</p> <p>Additionally, the stress to the other pod members should be considered as well, including the impact this may have on successful release.</p>				calf is rejected and required recapturing	
1C	Release into a different pod with no lactating female	Whenever a pod with a female is found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As above, with much lower likelihood that pod will accept calf. TAG did not discuss this option 	[REDACTED]	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Injury risk sustained during transport.</p> <p>Starvation risk unless female spontaneously lactates.</p> <p>Requires satellite tag to be applied, which is physically invasive.</p> <p>Direct injuries from the pod if the calf is</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Stress of handling/ transportation.</p> <p>While calf may benefit from being with a pod, there is unknown chance of a female lactating, which would</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Welfare risks are significant. All of the above apply.</p> <p>Stress during transportation and likelihood of rejection/lack of food availability.</p> <p>Additionally, the stress to the other pod members</p>		<p>MODERATE</p> <p>Likely to be seen as better than nothing, but not likely to succeed</p>	<p>Scenario 2 – Extended holding time</p> <p>Scenario 3 – Transport</p> <p>Scenario 4 – Tagging and monitoring</p> <p>Scenario 6 – Recapture (if calf rejected)</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Locating and confirming a pod with a female, plus tracking pod.</p> <p>Applying tag and ensuring health is appropriate for release.</p>	<p>VERY LOW - NOT RECOMMENDED</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
					not accepted (ramming, raking etc)	cause significant stress. Extreme stress of isolation and lack of food If the calf has habituated to humans putting it back into a pod environment is also likely to be stressful.	should be considered as well, including the impact this may have on successful release.				Appropriate boat to transfer calf to water. Safe and effective means of transferring calf to water. Staff H&S during operation Needs contingencies in place for if the calf is rejected and required recapturing.	
2	Extended holding time	Status quo, but questions about how long this can be maintained.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dependent upon success of veterinary interventions. Likelihood of calf health issues increases with longer duration of separation from mother. Increased likelihood that mother will stop lactating as time goes on, meaning successful reintroduction to natal pod is less likely. Likelihood of habituation to humans increases as interactions continue, which may inhibit ability to successfully integrate back into a wild pod. There are no care facilities in NZ appropriate to hold an orca. Significant issues with any attempt to hold the animal long enough for 	[REDACTED]	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Dependent upon success of veterinary interventions.</p> <p>Likely to have increased health risks with time.</p> <p>Current level of veterinary oversight is not possible in its current form long-term - but is required to ensure this individual stays healthy</p>	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Additional stress of further handling and habituation to humans.</p> <p>Ongoing social isolation from other orca will cause distress.</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>Lack of appropriate care facilities in NZ.</p> <p>Habituation will increase, especially with current recall training taking place under Ingrid's instruction.</p> <p>Holding calf in captivity.</p> <p>There is little reason to believe that other than life support the animal is in a positive behavioural welfare state in this scenario and current timeline is already stretching</p>		<p>MODERATE</p> <p>There is a strong ethos in NZ against holding marine mammals in captivity. While not evident at present, public perception may rise against this effort the longer the calf is held.</p>	<p>Scenario 5 – Training and weaning</p>	<p>HIGH</p> <p>Permit to hold calf in captivity</p> <p>Safe and effective means of retaining calf in captivity.</p> <p>Staff H&S risks</p>	<p>LOW, decreasing over time</p> <p>Not supported by AEC members</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			it to be weaned and independent <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ethical and Legal risks around holding a calf in captivity 	[REDACTED]			beyond expert advice recommendations. Negative welfare states are being eliminated by quality veterinary care but this is not sufficient for positive animal welfare of a highly social, highly intelligent creature to be across the 5 welfare domains					
2A	Hold calf in existing Plimmerton sea pen and/or pool	Status quo, but questions about how long this can be maintained	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current sea pen at Plimmerton is very small. 3.5m depth at high tide and only 1.5m at low tide. Current site cannot be used indefinitely as it is not well-sheltered and requires moving the calf between pen and pool. 	[REDACTED]	HIGH As above	HIGH As above	VERY HIGH As above		MODERATE As above	Scenario 5 – Training and weaning	HIGH As above	LOW, decreasing over time
2B	Relocate calf to alternative sea pen	Dependent upon locating a suitable sea pen and other logistics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Iwi may not approve of moving calf out of their rohe There are no alternative purpose-built facilities in New Zealand. Site investigation would be required by experts in orca care in order to determine suitability of alternatives Significant logistics associated with moving calf, plus unknown cost implications Potential health/welfare issues for calf during moving Needs clear expectations of how 	[REDACTED]	HIGH As above	HIGH As above	VERY HIGH As above Extends stress and health risks to end up in similar risks under recapture considerations.	MODERATE Iwi's strong preference is for calf to remain in their rohe, however the calf's health and welfare would take priority.	MODERATE As above	Scenario 3 – Transport Scenario 5 – Training and weaning	VERY HIGH Would require substantial commitment of resources to investigate suitable alternatives and arrange transfer of the calf.	LOW, decreasing over time - NOT RECOMMENDED

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			care, etc. will be handled at new site.									
3	Transport	Dependent on scenario above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Transport of the calf requires significant logistical and veterinary support Clear instructions needed on what to do in a variety of circumstances Welfare and health concerns for calf as transport likely to be distressing 	[REDACTED]	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>Injury risk associated with removing the calf from the water, loading in transport vessel, moving to new location, and unloading.</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>Being restrained while out of water is likely to increase distress.</p> <p>Unfamiliar noise, locations, vibrations may increase distress.</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>Unnecessary or repeated movements of the calf carried increased risks and are difficult to justify.</p> <p>Transport of animals can negatively impact an animal's welfare, especially if they are already compromised. Moving the calf, even according to the best of plans will be stressful.</p>		<p><i>LOW</i></p> <p>Not something that most people will be concerned about, as long as movement is based on welfare.</p>		<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>Need appropriate equipment to restrain and hold calf without injury, vehicles/vessels suitable for transport.</p> <p>More difficult the further the calf is moved and the older (larger) it becomes.</p>	<p>N/A</p> <p>This is a factor which will affect likelihood of other options</p>
3A	Transport to pod	Dependent on scenario above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Finding a pod and staying with them will be difficult, especially if the health of the calf must be assessed, tags applied, and so forth prior to release. Requires vessel and other equipment suitable to carry the calf Needs clear protocol on how to reintroduce the calf and whether (and how) to recapture calf if initial introduction is unsuccessful. 	[REDACTED]	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>As above</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>As above</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>As above</p> <p>Potential that pod cannot be relocated and calf subjected to unnecessary risks of transport.</p> <p>Risk of rejection, necessitating recapture.</p> <p>Additionally, the stress to the other pod members should be considered as well, including the impact this may have on successful release.</p>		<p><i>LOW</i></p> <p>Most people are hopeful that this will happen.</p>	<p>Scenario 4 – Tagging and monitoring</p> <p>Scenario 6 - Recapture</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i></p> <p>As above</p>	<p>N/A</p> <p>This is a factor which will affect likelihood of success of other options</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
3B	Transport to alternative holding site	Dependent on scenario above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Potential for increased health/welfare impacts on calf if greater distance of transport requires holding and restraining it for longer 	[REDACTED]	<p><i>MODERATE</i> As above</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i> As above</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i> As above</p> <p>Risk that new location is not appreciably better than the existing location and movement is unnecessary.</p> <p>No, as above longer duration of captivity decreases quality of life, eustress, or positive behavioural elements. Longer duration in isolation with conspecifics is not recommended.</p>		<p><i>MODERATE</i> Will need to be justified.</p>		<p><i>MODERATE</i> As above</p>	<p>N/A - NOT RECOMMENDED as per scenario 2B</p>
3C	Transporting to another country	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> TAG considered this was not an option for cultural/ethical/animal welfare reasons. Many welfare, legal and political issues. 	N/A	<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>	<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>	<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>	<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>	<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>		<p><i>VERY HIGH</i></p>	<p>NIL - NOT RECOMMENDED Option should not be considered</p>
4	Tagging and monitoring	Dependent on scenario above	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Will allow tracking of animals remotely and ability to locate the tagged animal on the water to assess well-being. Tags are invasive and require a surgical procedure to bolt them through the dorsal fin. Animal ethics approval will be required, with appropriate procedures to ensure the safety of the tagged animal A satellite tag appropriate for this purpose is on its way to 	[REDACTED]	<p><i>MODERATE</i> Requires drilling a hole through the dorsal fin, use of drugs, risk of infection, and may experience some physical discomfort as it heals.</p> <p>Tagged animal will have additional drag associated with the tag while swimming, however this could be minimised by using the cetacean tag</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i> Some mental distress may result from the actual procedure, but this is of limited duration.</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i> Capture and restraint is only justifiable to potentially save the life of the animal being tagged.</p> <p>Mandatory for any release. However, this does not guarantee a positive outcome once released. Ability to locate animal is not the same as ability to</p>		<p><i>MODERATE</i> Public perception may be against invasive procedures unless appropriately justified</p>	<p>Scenario 6 – Recapture</p> <p>Scenario 7 – Euthanasia</p>	<p><i>MODERATE</i> Requires suitably trained personnel, medical and veterinary equipment, drugs, and logistics associated with removing the calf from the water and restraining during the procedure</p>	<p>N/A This is a factor which will affect likelihood of success of other options and will help us meet welfare obligations</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			<p>DOC from IFAW in the US</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This is a well-recognised method for monitoring stranded animals post release and has been done on a wide range of species in other countries. A secondary VHF tag to allow fine-scale locating at sea is still being sought 		designed to minimise drag.		monitor its health and social acceptance regularly enough to ensure animal is not suffering.					
4A	Tagging calf	Associated with release of calf	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tagging creates some additional risk to the calf, both via the surgical procedure and via effects of wearing the device. However, this is offset by the ability to find the calf repeatedly to assess welfare Would facilitate confirmation that release was successful and the option for recapture if unsuccessful and calf in declining health Clear rules needed for recapture, likely as specified in a permit issued under the MMPA. An unsuccessful attempt, particularly with the natal pod, will almost certainly require recapture and euthanasia; protocols for decision-making should be specified in advance 		MODERATE As above	LOW As above, noting that this is likely to be not substantially more distressing than tube feeding which has already occurred.	MODERATE As above Recapture plans should also be mandatory before release.		MODERATE As above	Scenario 6 – Recapture Scenario 7 – Euthanasia	MODERATE As above	N/A This is a factor which will affect likelihood of success of other options and will help us meet welfare obligations
4B	Tagging natal pod member	Only if natal pod sighted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tagging a member of the natal pod would allow us to track the pod without constantly following it in a vessel 		VERY HIGH Whales and dolphins are prone to experiencing capture myopathy, an often	VERY HIGH Unlike the calf which is already under care and	VERY HIGH Puts an otherwise healthy adult from a Nationally				VERY HIGH Do not currently have a tag to apply.	N/A but NOT RECOMMENDED This is a factor which will affect likelihood of

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			<p>and/or keeping a lookout on land</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would require animal ethics approval and MMPA permit to capture an adult and apply the tag, as this cannot be done remotely except with short-duration suction-cup tags • Significant welfare concerns associated with such a capture make this option impractical. • Also would require an additional satellite tag, not currently in NZ 		<p>fatal reaction to capture and removal from the water.</p> <p>Capture of a wild adult at sea has a very high likelihood of injuring the animal.</p> <p>Other risks as noted above.</p>	<p>partially habituated to handling, an adult wild orca would likely experience significant mental stress associated with capture and tagging.</p>	<p>Critical population at risk.</p>				<p>No people in NZ experienced with capturing an adult orca in the wild.</p> <p>Health and safety risks associated with at-sea capture of a large animal.</p> <p>No permit given for this, and does not assure welfare of calf.</p>	<p>success of other options, but puts an otherwise healthy adult orca at substantial risk</p>
5	Training and weaning	If calf is held for an extended time	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Weaning the animal would increase options for release • Age of calf is uncertain (2-6 months), but weaning is generally not advised before 9 months at the earliest. Natural weaning usually occurs at 1-2years of age. • Open water training could be needed, i.e. gradually remove calf from pen as weaned with aim to reunite into a pod. • Some training to be able to recall the calf on command is already occurring, per comments from Ingrid Visser • Any training significantly increases the likelihood of this animal becoming a public nuisance after release. 		<p>MODERATE</p> <p>As the calf is already interacting with people and (according to Ingrid) is learning to respond to commands, it is likely this could continue with little risk to the animal.</p> <p>Weaning the calf would increase physical risks as he attempts to learn to forage for himself.</p> <p>Currently it is against the animal welfare act to feed live vertebrates to captive animals in New Zealand and as such live food currently would not be able to be fed to assess the individual's ability to hunt.</p>	<p>HIGH</p> <p>The calf will continue to be isolated from other orca and is likely to experience mental stress as a result.</p>	<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>This will require habituation of the calf to humans and runs a very high risk of creating a public nuisance should he be released in future. This will endanger both the animal and humans.</p> <p>This is not an acceptable outcome for a wild animal aiming to be repatriated at sea and re-integrated successfully.</p>				<p>VERY HIGH</p> <p>There are no orca trainers in NZ, nor an appropriate facility to use for training over many months.</p> <p>Would require source of live fish (stingrays) to train the calf to hunt and feed itself which is illegal (only live food allowed to be fed to captive animals are invertebrates).</p>	<p>VERY LOW - NOT RECOMMENDED</p> <p>No calf has been successfully weaned in captivity and then returned to the wild</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ethics, logistics, media and public backlash, precedent. Legal risks 									
6	Recapture		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Will be required if any release attempt is unsuccessful Creates physical risks in recapturing a wild animal, plus ethical and legal questions about the same If recapture fails, calf will likely starve to death over an extended time. Pressure likely to be exerted to recapture and make another attempt (rather than euthanise) for any scenario other than 1A. 	[REDACTED]	<p>HIGH Injury risk sustained during recapture.</p>	<p>HIGH Additional stress of further handling/ transportation.</p> <p>Extreme stress of isolation and lack of food, should recapture fail.</p>	<p>HIGH Stress during transportation and likelihood of rejection/lack of food availability.</p> <p>Failure to recapture means calf would die slowly.</p> <p>A recapture plan should be established as a minimum BEFORE any potential release, including any potential legal challenges if recapture then includes captive housing. Likely legal challenges based on international cases of similar examples (female orca calf and Loro Parque case).</p>		<p>MODERATE Recapture (and euthanasia) after a failed release attempt may be seen as limited effort.</p> <p>'Losing' the calf at sea will likewise be concerning to many.</p>		<p>HIGH Requires permit to recapture calf</p> <p>Locating calf again will be difficult, even with a tag applied.</p> <p>Appropriate boat to enable recapture</p> <p>Safe and effective means of transferring calf from water</p> <p>Staff H&S during operation</p>	<p>LOW Any release attempt which necessitates recapture should be followed by euthanasia</p>
7	Euthanasia	When deemed the most appropriate option for calf welfare	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public backlash is likely if all other options have not been exhausted Ongoing discussion about method to be used: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ballistics are the only method in the DOC SOP 	[REDACTED]	<p>LOW Euthanasia always carries some risk of inflicting unintentional physical pain or injury, should it be undertaken incorrectly and not result in immediate</p>	<p>MODERATE Unfamiliar noise, location, transport, may all cause stress.</p>	<p>LOW Euthanasia will only be undertaken after assessing other options and determining that this is the best</p>		<p>HIGH There is still a strong expectation that everything will be done to save the</p>	<p><i>Scenario 3 – Recapture</i></p>	<p>LOW Requires experienced staff and a suitable location, as well as a suitable disposal location.</p>	<p>N/A This is a factor which will help us meet welfare obligations</p>

Option	Scenario	Timing	Risks/Concerns	Legal Advice PRIVILEGED DO NOT SHARE OUTSIDE DOC	Physical Health Risks	Mental Health Risks	Welfare/ ethics risks	Cultural risks	Public Perception risks	Dependencies	Difficulty of implementation	Likelihood of success*
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Others are pushing for chemical methods TAG advice is there are alternatives but that a sub-group should be convened to discuss further. 		death, but trained and experienced staff are available.	Could be minimised through sedation prior to euthanasia.	action for the welfare of the calf.		life of the calf.			
7A	Deteriorating orca leading to decision to euthanise	Based on health protocols	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Health assessment is in place but no clear thresholds identified when this option should take place Method used will require different personnel and different handling of carcass 	[REDACTED]	<p>LOW As above</p>	<p>MODERATE As above</p>	<p>VERY LOW As above, with added support of declining health</p> <p>This is a necessary fail safe but best practice would allow euthanasia before irreversible suffering has occurred.</p>		<p>MODERATE Public desire for a good outcome will likely be offset by declining health</p>		<p>LOW As above</p>	<p>N/A This is a factor which will help us meet welfare obligations</p>
7B	Stable orca but euthanasia on ethical grounds	Operational decision	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As above. TAG discussion was that this was an operations/animal health/welfare consideration 	[REDACTED]	<p>LOW As above</p>	<p>MODERATE As above</p>	<p>MODERATE Euthanising a stable orca while there is still a chance (albeit very small) of a positive outcome is more difficult to justify on welfare concerns.</p>		<p>VERY HIGH Most vocal public will object to euthanising a calf whose health is stable and under active management</p>		<p>LOW As above</p>	<p>N/A This is a factor which will help us meet welfare obligations</p> <p>RECOMMENDED OPTION of AEC members</p>

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 1:54 pm
To: [REDACTED] (@Parliament); [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]
Subject: RE: Kapiti Orca Calf - Scenarios Paper - DOC-6729062

Thanks Sarah

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 1:53 PM
To: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
Cc: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz; [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
Subject: FW: Kapiti Orca Calf - Scenarios Paper - DOC-6729062

Kia ora [REDACTED]

We have received the attached scenarios paper from DOC regarding the orca calf at Kāpiti. As this remains an operational matter, it is for our information only.

A copy of this (with the legal advice removed) will be shared with stakeholders this afternoon, as per Kirstie's email below. A decision will be taken by a DOC senior leader, likely tomorrow.

Ngā mihi,



[REDACTED] | Private Secretary (Conservation)
Office of the Minister of Conservation
4.5L Executive Wing, Parliament Buildings | Private Bag 18888 | Wellington 6160 | New Zealand
[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
[SEEMAIL]

From: Kirstie Knowles [<mailto:kknowles@doc.govt.nz>]
Sent: Thursday, 22 July 2021 1:25 PM
To: [REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz
Cc: Elizabeth Heeg <eh EEG@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: Kapiti Orca Calf - Scenarios Paper - DOC-6729062

Kia ora [REDACTED]

Please find attached the orca stranding response scenarios paper for your information.

Please note that DOC officials are planning to talk through this paper this afternoon with Ngāti Toa Rangatira and the Orca Research Trust/WhaleRescue.org (both led by Dr Ingrid Visser). We will be putting a decision paper to the decision maker tomorrow, drawing on the views shared today.

Ngā mihi nui,

Kirstie

Kirstie Knowles (she/her)
Manager Marine Ecosystems – *Kaimātanga Mātai Ahu Moana*
Aquatic Unit, Biodiversity Group – *Kāhui Kanorau Koiora*
Department of Conservation – *Te Papa Atawhai*


Phone: [REDACTED]

www.doc.govt.nz



~Toitū te marae o Tane, Toitū te marae o Tangaroa, Toitū te iwi - If the land endures, and the sea endures, so too will the people~



 Please consider the environment before you print this e-mail

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday, 23 July 2021 7:44 am
To: Kirsty Prior; Ian Angus; Jack Mace; Sarah Owen; Bronwyn Saunders; Elizabeth Heeg; Sarah [REDACTED] (@Parliament)
Subject: RE: Fwd: Wastewater sewage

Thanks Kirsty

[REDACTED]
Press secretary to Hon Kiri Allan

From: Kirsty Prior <kprior@doc.govt.nz>
Date: Friday, 23 Jul 2021, 6:53 AM
To: Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>, Jack Mace <jmace@doc.govt.nz>, Sarah Owen <sarahowen@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <[\[REDACTED\]@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)>, Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz>, Elizabeth Heeg <eheeg@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <[\[REDACTED\]@parliament.govt.nz](mailto:[REDACTED]@parliament.govt.nz)>
Subject: Fwd: Wastewater sewage

Hi team,

We investigated last night at the leak and spoke with the engineer at the leak site. It was considered very minor with no health risk to people (or animal) at our location. The leak had stopped before 11.30pm and have been assured it is fixed.

We will initiate a better alert system with the council today. And we'll re-introduce or check washing protocols at site.

Cheers,

Kirsty
Operations Manager Aotea

On 22/07/2021 10:12 pm, Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz> wrote:
Fyi.

Cheers
Bronwyn

----- Forwarded message -----

From: [REDACTED]
Date: 22/07/2021 9:22 pm
Subject: Wastewater sewage
To: [REDACTED]@rnz.co.nz, Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>
Cc:

> Hi [REDACTED]
> We've been working with the council all week who have been monitoring water quality following the storm.
> I'll be in touch tomorrow if there are any further updates
>
> Sent from Workspace ONE Boxer
>
> On 22/07/2021 8:08 PM, [REDACTED]@rnz.co.nz wrote:

> Kia ora,
>
> I'm writing to just ask if you know of the pipe burst in Porirua which is sending sewage into the harbour?
>
> I was wanting to see if this will impact on your plans to re-introduce Toa back into his sea pen?
>
> Are you able to send me a quick comment on whether this is affecting you at all?

> Many thanks,

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED] | He/Him | Reporter (Wellington Issues)

> [REDACTED]

> Radio New Zealand | Level 2 | 155 The Terrace

> [REDACTED]

> PO Box 123 | Wellington | New Zealand 6140

> [REDACTED]

> Mob.: [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> [REDACTED]

> Emails sent by Radio New Zealand Limited (RNZ) or any related entity, including any attachments, may be confidential, protected by copyright and/or subject to privilege. If you receive an email from RNZ in error, please inform the sender immediately, delete it from your system and do not use, copy or disclose any of the information in that email for any purpose. Emails to/from RNZ may undergo email filtering and virus scanning, including by third party contractors. However, RNZ does not guarantee that any email or any attachment is secure, error-free or free of viruses or other unwanted or unexpected inclusions. The views expressed in any non-business email are not necessarily the views of RNZ. www.rnz.co.nz

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.

[REDACTED]

From: [REDACTED]
Sent: Friday, 23 July 2021 9:32 pm
To: Bronwyn Saunders; Social Media; [REDACTED]; Media; [REDACTED];
Webteam; [REDACTED]
Cc: Reg Kemper; Kirsty Prior; Elizabeth Heeg; Kristopher Ramm; Ian Angus; [REDACTED]
(@Parliament); Sarah Owen; Vicki Connor
Subject: RE: orca died

From the Minister

Nice team, all sounds in hand. I've spoken with a few of the team on ground, some of the iwi folk and Debbie Ngatewa Packer who is out there. Sounds like things have calmed down from where they were before. Please pass on my regards to all the doc team out there that will no doubt be tired but have been doing a great job around the clock.

[REDACTED]
Press secretary to Hon Kiri Allan

From: Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz>
Date: Friday, 23 Jul 2021, 9:20 PM
To: Social Media <socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED], Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED], Webteam <HOWebTeam@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED]
Cc: Reg Kemper <rkemper@doc.govt.nz>, Kirsty Prior <kprior@doc.govt.nz>, Elizabeth Heeg <eheeg@doc.govt.nz>, Kristopher Ramm <kramm@doc.govt.nz>, Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>, [REDACTED], [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>, [REDACTED] <@parliament.govt.nz>, Sarah Owen <sarahowen@doc.govt.nz>, Vicki Connor <vconnor@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: orca died

Hi

I've just spoken to Ian who's agreed to continue as spokesman – need statement signed off asap. No interviews tonight but Ian will be onsite at about 5.45am tomorrow and can do media then.

[REDACTED], know it is early but hoping you can be there then to sort and wrangle. I've confirmed with TVNZ and Newshub that Toa dead and that statement coming soon.

Thanks

Bronwyn

From: Social Media <socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>
Sent: Friday, 23 July 2021 9:16 pm
To: Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz>; Social Media <socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED] <Media@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED] <HOWebTeam@doc.govt.nz>
Cc: Reg Kemper <rkemper@doc.govt.nz>; Kirsty Prior <kprior@doc.govt.nz>; Elizabeth Heeg <eheeg@doc.govt.nz>; Kristopher Ramm <kramm@doc.govt.nz>; Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: orca died

Kia ora Bronwyn,

I'll get a post up ASAP.

Cheers,
[REDACTED]

From: Bronwyn Saunders <bsaunders@doc.govt.nz>
Sent: Friday, 23 July 2021 9:13 PM

To: Social Media <socialmedia@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED]; Media <Media@doc.govt.nz>; [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Webteam <HOWebTeam@doc.govt.nz>
Cc: Reg Kemper <rkemper@doc.govt.nz>; Kirsty Prior <kprior@doc.govt.nz>; Elizabeth Heeg <eheeg@doc.govt.nz>;
Kristopher Ramm <kramm@doc.govt.nz>; Ian Angus <iangus@doc.govt.nz>

Subject: orca died

Hi team

The orca has died. I've got a draft release with Reg and the team for sign off but can social media start working up a post real quick. It has been announced on social media a few minutes go.

Draft

Baby Toa loses fight for survival

Despite a massive community effort to save the baby orca known as Toa, the abandoned calf has tonight died in the sea near Plimmerton Boating club.

The condition of the juvenile orca that stranded 13 days ago began to deteriorate about 5pm, sinking and remaining on the seabed.

DOC spokesperson says the many DOC staff, Orca Research Trust/Whale Rescue, local iwi Ngāti Toa Rangatira, and the local community threw everything at trying to save him.

"We were always aware that the longer he was in captivity, away from his mother, the more likely it was that his health would deteriorate.

"Toa passed quickly, surrounded by love with his last days made as comfortable as possible.

"Throughout this entire effort, we've all been united in wanting to do what's best for the orca. Finding and reuniting him with his pod was still our goal as we headed into the weekend.

It was always a long shot that we would be able to successfully reunite Toa with his pod. The odds were against us - there's no worldwide precedent for an unweaned orca calf being taken into human care and later repatriated to a pod.

Nevertheless, this calf had captured hearts and no one wanted to believe that he didn't have a fighting chance despite the hand fate had dealt him.

Planning is now underway to give the community that provided such aroha to this young orca an opportunity to farewell Toa and recognise the very special place he made in the short time he was with us.

ENDS

Last Sunday (11 July), the orca calf was stranded on rocks near Plimmerton, north of Wellington. Less than 2.5m long, it is thought to be 2 to 6 months old.

The operation to care for the orca calf was led by DOC with support from Orca Research Trust/Whale Rescue Trust, local iwi Ngāti Toa Rangatira, and the local community.

Whale-Rescue.org

4m ·

We have to report that a little time ago Toa passed away, he rapidly deteriorated and vets on site rushed to his aid. But were unable to save him. We have no further details as to what happened as you can all imagine we are devastated. No more updates will be posted at this time.

Caution - This message and accompanying data may contain information that is confidential or subject to legal privilege. If you are not the intended recipient you are notified that any use, dissemination, distribution or copying of this message or data is prohibited. If you received this email in error, please notify us immediately and erase all copies of the message and attachments. We apologise for the inconvenience. Thank you.